WEST Standards for Issue and Volume Level Validation

These standards are used to prepare a single Shared Print Journal Archive from the holdings of multiple library partners. The standards define the level of effort to place on coordinating holdings and verifying completeness and condition. The standards also set expectations about the types of conditions and gaps that can be found in the resulting archive.

These standards are used to validate print journal holdings at one of two levels depending upon the archive type (Silver or Gold).

- Silver archives are validated at the volume level for completeness only (not condition).
- Gold archives are validated at the issue level for completeness and condition.

The standards are designed to

1. establish a basic set of validation requirements that are less intensive than page-level validation but meet some basic expectations
2. provide transparency among the research library community about the content that can be found in the shared print journal archive and the condition in which it can be found.
   Transparency is achieved by
   a. explicitly defining the actions performed (and not performed) to secure a near-complete backfile
   b. explicitly defining conditions of the material that are (and are not) accepted in the archive
   c. disclosing completeness (and missing content) in descriptive records in union catalogs
   d. disclosing condition information in descriptive records in union catalogs

Scope of Holdings and Contribution Expectations

It is assumed that validation occurs within the context of the holdings of WEST member libraries. Print journal holdings may be contributed by one or many libraries and members are expected to contribute holdings to secure the most complete backfile possible from those represented in the aggregate collections. Efforts are not made to acquire volumes or issues beyond the holdings of the WEST membership. Gaps and condition problems are recorded in descriptive records in union catalogs.

Standards

To be considered validated, a Silver Archive

1. must meet standards for completeness (as described in the completeness section).
2. specific actions must be taken (as described in the decision matrix) when problems of completeness or contribution are identified.
3. Information about completeness and actions taken must be explicitly recorded in descriptive records in union catalogs.

To be considered validated, a Gold Archive

1. Must meet standards for completeness and condition (as described in the completeness and condition sections).
2. Specific actions must be taken (as described in the decision matrix) when problems of completeness, condition or contribution are identified.
3. Information about completeness, condition and actions taken must be explicitly recorded in descriptive records in union catalogs.

If any of these three steps are not met, the archive is not considered validated.

Completeness (Silver and Gold Archives)

Reasonable efforts are made to compile a complete or near complete archive of a journal in the context of the Content Partners’ holdings. The holdings are compiled, duplicates removed and a single archive of all published volumes, issues and supplements available is deposited. The archive is disclosed as a shared archive and known gaps are recorded in a union catalog(s) in such a manner as to facilitate the automated preparation of gaps lists (separate from holdings lists).

Definition. Silver Archive.

A complete Shared Print Journal Archive consists of all volumes published for a particular journal and its historical title variants from volume 1 to a designated year (or until the year the publication ceased or was suspended) for which holdings exist within the Content Partners’ libraries.

Definition. Gold Archive.

A complete Shared Print Journal Archive consists of all issues and supplements published for a particular journal and its historical title variants from volume 1 issue 1 to a designated year (or until the year the publication ceased or was suspended) for which holdings exist within the Content Partners’ libraries.

Determining completeness

The level of effort placed on verifying completeness depends upon

- the publication history for a journal
- the unit of publication for verification
- libraries’ physical holdings and willingness to contribute
- quality of bibliographic and holdings records, particularly in union catalogs
In most cases, there is no single verifiable list of the complete publication history of a journal. Completeness can be determined by consulting various sources including local catalog records, union catalog records, inspection of physical pieces, publisher’s lists of historical volumes/issues, out-of-print vendors’ catalogs and advanced researchers with special knowledge about the publication. Consultation of each source implies an additional amount of effort.

**Process for determining completeness**

A reasonable effort to determine the publication history of a journal and secure a complete archive consists of consulting:

1. The physical piece
2. Local catalog entries
3. Union catalog entries for the Content Partners’ holdings

To be considered validated, the above three sources must be consulted.

The following additional sources do not need to be consulted for the archive to be considered validated. These are acknowledged here and explicitly excluded from the validation requirements to manage the level of effort placed on verifying completeness.

4. Publisher lists. Publishers may maintain lists of the historical issues and volumes published for a journal.
5. Electronic holdings list (or lists for other formats.) Lists of historical issues and volumes published for a journal in alternate formats may be available.
6. Users, researchers. Advanced researchers may have knowledge of specific important issues, articles or other historic content published in a journal.

**Silver Archives**

Begin with an inspection of the physical pieces (typically a run of bound volumes).

1. Review the enumeration pattern for the volumes
   a. Look for obvious missing volumes
   b. Look at the binding labels, volume and date statements
2. Accession all of the volumes present into the Shared Print Journal Archive.
3. If volumes are missing or out of sync with the binding, volume and date statements, consult library bibliographic records to verify the publication history.

**Gold Archives**

Begin with an inspection of the physical pieces (typically a run of bound volumes).

1. Flip through the text block of the physical volume or issue (if unbound).
   a. Look for obvious missing issues
   b. Look at the binding labels, volume, issue and date statements

---

1 Research libraries tend to have a more complete understanding of a journal’s publication history than the publisher. If an archive exists that has been validated to a higher standard (i.e. a page-validated archive), assume that that archive has the most complete list of a publication’s history. The holdings for the volume or issue-validated archive should be validated against the page-validated archive’s inventory check-list.
2. If all of the issues are present, the volume is a likely candidate for the Shared Print Journal Archive. Review the condition of the volume (next section).
3. If issues are missing or out of sync with the binding, volume, issue and date statements, consult library bibliographic records to verify the publication history.

Condition (Gold Archives)
Reasonable efforts are made to identify the issues that are in the best, readable condition among the Content Partners’ holdings and that are capable of sustaining an agreed upon preservation horizon.

Definition.

Readable condition. A shared print journal archive is in readable condition when the entire text block can be read by the human eye. Words are not lost at the margins or on the pages due to publishing or binding errors, significant damage or markings.

Best condition. When multiple readable copies are available, the copy that meets most of the acceptable conditions is selected. The decision matrix below describes how to make decisions when the best copy cannot be determined.

Preservation Horizon. The time period for which the physical material is expected to last in readable condition when stored in defined environmental conditions. The horizon is formally agreed upon by the Content Partners.

Process for determining best, readable condition
- Flip through the complete text block of the physical volume or issue (if unbound).
- Look at the binding and sewing for indications of loose pages and tight bindings
- Test some pages for sufficient flexibility to sustain photocopying

Issues are accepted (or not) into the Shared Print Journal Archive based on the following criteria. In some cases, action must be taken to remedy and/or document the condition before the volumes and issues can be accepted into the archive.

2 The standards do not attempt to provide an exhaustive list of possible conditions that may be found in journal holdings. It is assumed that the holdings meet basic criteria for deposit in an off-site shelving facility and that the facility has specific requirements for the condition of materials that can be deposited (e.g. for mold, presence of insects, etc.).
**Decision Matrix and Expected Actions (Silver and Gold Archives)**

When validating journal holdings, it is likely that multiple problems may be identified including problems of completeness, condition or contribution. The following standard actions are expected and must be taken to address each problem. These actions are designed to keep validation effort to a reasonable minimum and to provide transparency across the partnership about actions taken to verify completeness and condition.

*Table 1: Expected Actions*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Archive Types</th>
<th>Problem Type</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Silver and Gold</td>
<td>Contribution</td>
<td>1. Content Partner does not wish to contribute recent volumes or issues.</td>
<td>Implement a 3 or 5 year rolling wall in the Shared Print Journal Archive agreement with the Content Partner. Otherwise, seek another Content Partner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silver and Gold</td>
<td>Contribution</td>
<td>2. Complete or near complete holdings are available among Content Partners, but none of the partners are willing to contribute a significant portion of the older volumes or issues (backfile issues).</td>
<td>The entire journal is not a candidate for the Shared Print Archive. Remove the journal from the Shared Print program. If a portion of the Shared Print Archive has already been processed, annotate the remaining unprocessed issues as missing issues in descriptive records in union catalogs and discontinue work on the journal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silver and Gold</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>3. Missing volumes.</td>
<td>Seek missing volumes from Content Partners. If none are available, annotate the missing volumes in descriptive records in union catalogs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>5. Volumes with missing issues.</td>
<td>Accession multiple volumes into the Shared Print Journal Archive to complete the archive. Document any remaining missing issues in descriptive records in union catalogs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>6. Missing issues. (for unbound issues)</td>
<td>Seek missing issues from Content Partners. If none are available, document missing issues in descriptive records in union catalogs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>7. Reprints.</td>
<td>Seek another Content Partner. If no holdings are available among the Content Partners, accession reprints into the Shared Print Journal Archive. Document which volumes contain reprints in descriptive records in union catalogs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archive Types</td>
<td>Problem Type</td>
<td>Problem</td>
<td>Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>8.</td>
<td>If upon a general inspection of the issues a significant number of advertisements or images appear to be missing, seek another Content Partner. If no holdings are available among the Content Partners, accession issues into the Shared Print Journal Archive. Document which issues are missing advertisements in descriptive records in union catalogs. It is not necessary to identify or enumerate all missing ads or images. Simply record the fact that some ads and images are missing. Accession multiple volumes into the Shared Print Journal Archive to complete the archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>9.</td>
<td>If upon a general inspection of the issues a significant number of foldouts appear to be missing, seek another Content Partner. If no holdings are available among the Content Partners, accession issues into the Shared Print Journal Archive. Document which issues are missing foldouts in descriptive records in union catalogs. It is not necessary to identify or enumerate all missing foldouts. Simply record the fact that some foldouts are missing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>10.</td>
<td>If upon a general inspection of the issues a significant number of pages appear to be missing, document which issues are missing pages in descriptive records in union catalogs. It is not necessary to identify or enumerate all missing pages. Simply record the fact that some pages are missing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Seek another Content Partner. If no holdings are available among the Content Partners, accession issues into the Shared Print Journal Archive. Document which volumes have tight bindings in descriptive records in union catalogs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>12.</td>
<td><strong>No action necessary. This condition is acceptable.</strong> Accession the volume into the archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>13.</td>
<td><strong>No action necessary. This condition is acceptable.</strong> Accession the volume into the archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Document which volumes have brittle paper in union catalogs and accession the volume into the archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>15.</td>
<td><strong>No action necessary. This condition is acceptable.</strong> Accession the volume into the archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archive Types</td>
<td>Problem Type</td>
<td>Problem</td>
<td>Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>16. Unreadable text block (e.g. glue damage, printing mistakes, shot text)</td>
<td>Not permitted in the archive. Seek another Content Partner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>17. Highlighting, marginalia, pencil and pen markings</td>
<td>If a significant number of pages have highlighting or markings that render the text unreadable, seek another Content Partner. Otherwise, accession the issues into the Shared Print Archive and document that some pages have highlighting or markings in descriptive records in union catalogs. Do not attempt to verify this at the page level, only at a cursory level by flipping through the text block.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>18. Separated pages 19. Loose pages</td>
<td>If more than 10 pages in a volume, seek another Content Partner. If none available, then reattach the pages or tie the volume with acid free string, whichever is fastest, and accession into the Shared Print Archive. If less than 10 pages in a volume, reattach the pages or tie the volume with acid free string, whichever is fastest, and accession into the Shared Print Archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>20. Missing issue covers</td>
<td>Document which volumes have missing issue covers in union catalogs and accession the volume into the archive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Only</td>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>21. Separated issue covers</td>
<td>Reattach the cover(s) or tie them with acid free string, whichever is fastest, and accession into the Shared Print Archive.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Definitions

1. **Journal.** A periodic publication in which researchers report the results of their work to their peer community. A “journal” refers to a particular publication, the name of which may change over time. For the purposes of these standards, a “journal” includes the current title and previous titles.
   a. **Current title.** The name currently used for the journal.
   b. **Previous title.** The name or names previously used for the journal.

2. **Holdings (Journal Holdings).** The physical content held by a library for a particular journal. A library’s holdings for a journal may be incomplete. And the holdings may be bound differently from institution to institution; the issues represented in a physical bound volume at one institution may be different from the issues in the same volume at another institution based on historic binding practices.

3. **Issue (Journal Issue).** A unit of publication of a journal. An issue is typically published on a periodic schedule (monthly, quarterly, etc.)

4. **Volume (Journal Volume).** There are two types of volumes: the published volume and the bound volume. For purposes of validation, statistics are kept about both kinds of volumes.
   a. Published volume: a unit of publication comprised of multiple issues and distinguished by an enumeration pattern determined by the publisher.
   b. Bound volume: a physical piece comprised of multiple issues and distinguished by an enumeration pattern determined by the library. This pattern may vary from library to library based on past binding practices.

5. **Shared Print Journal Archive.** A collection of print journals that are commonly held and to which access is shared.

6. **Content Partners.** The libraries and organizations that agree to contribute and compile substantive journal holdings to construct a single shared archive. They enter into a formal agreement which establishes the terms, obligations and expectations of the partnership and archive behaviors. In the case of WEST, the Content Partners are WEST member libraries and storage facilities.

7. **Defined Environmental Conditions.** Environmental conditions that are explicitly defined to support long term preservation of print materials. For WEST, environmental condition requirements are explicitly defined for each Archive Type.

8. **Validation.** Process by which the print holdings of a journal are confirmed by physical inspection and review. The intensity and extent of inspection may vary from high (page-level validation) to low (issue-level or volume-level validation).